

To the Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Centre for  
Accreditation and Quality Assurance of  
Education and Health Care  
November 10, 2024

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE  
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME  
60910200 "GENERAL MEDICINE"  
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF  
BACHELOR'S DEGREE PROGRAMMES  
OF THE ABU ALI IBN SINO BUKHARA STATE MEDICAL  
INSTITUTE**

**Period of external expert evaluation: October 16 - October 18, 2024**

**Almaty, 2024**

## CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine"	4
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" and conclusions on completion	6
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis for compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme	8
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine"	26
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	26
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine"	27
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	28
	Annex 3. Site visit programme	

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
DB	Basic disciplines
BSMI	Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sina
WHO	World Health Organization
VC	Videoconferencing
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES RUz	State Compulsory Education Standard of the Republic of Uzbekistan
SCES HE RUz	State Standard of Higher Education of the Republic of Uzbekistan
STC	State Testing Center
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
IRC	Information Resource Center
IT	Information Technologies
SFC	State Final Certification and Primary Accreditation of Graduates
CED	Catalog of Elective Disciplines
Criteria	Educational Institution Evaluation Criteria
QC	Qualification Characteristics
MPI	Medical and Preventive Institution
MHESI RUz	Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Innovation of the Republic of Uzbekistan
MHSSE RUz	Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education of the Republic of Uzbekistan
MOH RUz	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan
MCDP	multidisciplinary central district (city) polyclinics
MT	Master's thesis
RW	Research work
RWS	Research work of students
GED	General educational disciplines
EP	Educational programmes
MPEP	Main professional educational programme
ARI	Acute respiratory infections
OSCE	Objectively structured clinical examination
OSE	Objectively systematized examination
MS	Midterm survey
Academic staff	Academic staff
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
RUz	Republic of Uzbekistan
WC	Working curricula
RF	Russian Federation
RMS	rural medical stations
RFC	rural family clinics
FC	family clinics
SSS	Student scientific society
SRS	Independent work of students
SC BSMI	BSMI simulation center
TC	Typical curricula
EMC	Educational and methodological council
Curriculum	Curriculum
EII	Educational and industrial internship
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
EJ	Electronic journal
ECTS	European system of mutual credit offsets

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 32 dated 07.10.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" in the period from 16 to 18 October 2024, consisting of the following members:

<b>№</b>	<b>Status in the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty</b>
1	Chairman	YUSUPOV RUSTAM RAKHIMOVICH	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Microbiology, Virology of the National Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov", Member of the Expert Council for Academic Ranking of Educational programmes of the Bologna Process and Academic Mobility Centre of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
2	Foreign Expert	PROFESSOR LASZLO CSIBA	Professor of the Department of Neurology of the University of Debrecen, Member of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Member of the Editorial Board: "Neurosonology (Japan)", "Clinical Neurosciences" and Associate Editor of Frontiers in Stroke. Winner of the Presidential Széchenyi Prize of the Republic of Hungary for scientific results
3	Academic Expert	MAMARADZHABOV SOBIRZHON YERGASHEVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculty of International Education, Head of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the Paediatric Faculty of the Samarkand State Medical University, Samarkand
4	Academic Expert	SHOKIROV SHOKHRUKH TOLIBEKOVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, physician of the highest category, associate professor of the Department of Paediatric Maxillofacial Surgery of the Tashkent State Dental Institute, Tashkent
5	Academic Expert	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi
6	Academic Expert	ALMABAYEVA AIGUL YDYRYSOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Human Anatomy of the National Joint-Stock Company "Astana Medical University"
7	Academic Expert	BASKAKOVA IRINA VALENTINOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Therapeutic Dentistry of the National Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
8	Expert-Employer	SATTAROVA DILOROM SALOMOVNA	Chief physician of the clinic "Salomatlik Maskani", dentist of the highest category, member of the Liberal Democratic Party of

			Uzbekistan
10	Expert-Student	NASIMOVA MADINA ZARIFOVNA	4th year student in the specialty "General Medicine" of the NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
11	Expert-Student	KHANKHILDIEV DALER VYACHESLAVOVICH	2nd year student in the specialty "Dentistry", Tashkent Paediatric Medical Institute, Tashkent, Republic of Uzbekistan

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC.

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Bachelor's Degree Programmes of Medical Educational Institutions and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## **2. General part of the final report**

### **2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of the bachelor's degree 60910200**

#### **"General Medicine"**

Name of the organisation, legal form of ownership, TIN	Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino of the Republic of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan, 201511814
Management body	Supervisory Board
Full name of the first director	Teshaev Shukhrat Djumaevich
Date of establishment	1990
Location and contact details	200126, Bukhara city, Gijduvan street, 23 Tel: (0365) 223-0050 (+99895) 911-00-50
State license for educational activities in the bachelor's degree (date, number)	Certificate of state accreditation of the State Inspectorate for Quality Control of Education of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 48 dated 07/28/2022, series OT No. 5000048
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no
Year of commencement of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2022
Duration of study	6 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP	Bachelor's degrees - 610 Continued education in internship - 8 Total internship graduates - no
Number of students in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	Bachelors – 3277 Clinical residents – 507, interns – 8
Employment	Employment rate, % in dynamics for 5 years: 2020 - 90 2021 - 90 2022 - 93 2023 - 94 2024 - 94
Full-time teachers/part-time workers	Total teachers - 701, including full-time – 600, part-time

involved in the implementation of the EP	teachers – 101. Sedateness – 47,7%
Website	<a href="http://www.bsmi.uz">www.bsmi.uz</a>
Instagram	<a href="https://www.instagram.com/bsmi.uz/">https://www.instagram.com/bsmi.uz/</a>
Facebook with active pages	<a href="https://www.facebook.com/bsmi.uz/">https://www.facebook.com/bsmi.uz/</a>

## 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Until now, the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" has not been accredited.

## 2.3 Brief characteristics of the self-assessment report of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" and conclusions on its completeness

The self-assessment report of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 144 pages of the main text, annexes on 77 pages, electronic versions of documents located at the link [www.bsmi.uz](http://www.bsmi.uz).

The report is characterized by responses to 9 main standards for accreditation and criteria, structuring taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational programme, provided to the educational organisation by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head - Rector Teshaev Shukhrat Zhumaevich, who confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report. The report contains a list of 20 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organisation responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Davlatov Salim Sulaymonovich, head of the education quality control department.

Self-assessment of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Bukhara State Medical Institute No. 93/1 dated 03/17/2023 "On preparation for accreditation according to ECAQA standards".

All sections of the report present the actual practice of the Bukhara State Medical Institute in training bachelors in the specialty 60910200 "General Medicine" taking into account the start of student admission in 1991, substantiated data, examples of the implementation of the educational programme objectives, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results, the material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc.

The report was submitted to ECAQA in its final form, with data adjusted according to the above-mentioned recommendations. It is written in clear and competent language, with formulations for each standard being clear and understandable, and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards. Tables and figures are referenced in the text and follow a continuous numbering system.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as a basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure – the external evaluation. The experts have planned to validate the data in the report by comparing the information presented with the evidence obtained during the site visit to the educational organisation, i.e., to verify both quantitative and qualitative indicators.

## 3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organisations and educational programmes of the ECAQA and according to the programme approved on 14.10.2024 by the Director General of the ECAQA

Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of the Bukhara State Medical Institute Teshaev Shukhrat Zhumaevich. Dates of the visit to the organisation: October 16-18, 2024.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the self-assessment report data and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of standards for accreditation.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Site Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in Annex 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - a total of 15 people;
- interviews with students – 59 people in total, including 30 foreign students (Turkmenistan, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzstan, India, Pakistan, Jordan);
- study of the website\_- <https://bsmi.uz/obshaya-informacziya/> ;
- interviews - 10 employees, 25 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and students - 352 and 203, respectively;
- observation of student learning: attendance of 5 practical classes: Department of Histology, Cytology and Embryology, topic: Hematopoietic system, Bakhronov Zhurat Zhurakulovich, 2nd year students, main building; Department of Pathological Anatomy, topic: Nervous system, Abdullaeva Muslima Akhatovna, 2nd year students, main building; Department of General Surgery, topic: Purulent wounds, Safoev Bakodir Barnoevich, 3rd year students, Institute Clinic; Department of Paediatrics, topic: Navruzova Shakar Istamovna, 4th year students, Institute Clinic;
- lectures: Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, topic: Caesarean section, Karimova Nilufar Nabizhanovna, 5th year students, Institute Clinic.
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling standards for accreditation: 3 practice/clinical training bases were visited, including the Simulation Educational and Clinical Centre, the Institute Clinic, Bukhara City Family Polyclinic No. 4, where training is conducted under the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" with the participation of full-time teachers/part-time workers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 38 units both before the visit to the organisation and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The staff of the accredited organisation ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit programme and in the lists of interview sites and interviews (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Position</b>
1	Teshaev Shukhrat Zhumaevich	Rector
2	Zharylkasynova Gaukhar Zhanuzakovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
3	Tursunov Shermukhammadhozha Lutfulloevich	Vice-Rector for Medical Affairs
4	Bahranova Zubayda Saidovna	Vice-Rector for Youth Affairs and Spiritual and Moral Issues
5	Niyazov Laziz Nurkhonovich	Vice-Rector for International Cooperation
6	Sharipov Oybek Safarovich	Vice-Rector for Financial and Economic Issues
7	Rakhmatov Olim Bobomuradovich	Head of the Registrar's Office
8	Alieva Dilshod Musaevna	Head of the Information and Resource Centre, Library



9	Zoirov Maksud Islamovich	Centre for Digital Learning Technologies
10	Alimova Nargiza Rustamovna	Career Center
11	Khudoiberdiev Dilshod Karimovich	Dean of the Faculty of Medicine
12	Khasanova Dilnoza Akhrarovna	Dean of Foreign Students
13	Salomova Hanifa Zhakhonovna	Educational and Methodological Department
14	Khamidova Dilorom Olimovna	Department of Marketing and Student Internship
15	Soliev Alisher Urokovich	Simulation Educational and Clinical Centre

On the last day of the visit to the organisation, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, examination of documents, interview results, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" for Compliance with the ECAQA Standards for accreditation." The EEC members made no comments. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairman of the ECAQA Accreditation Council, Yusupov Rustam Rakhimovich, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the University's corporate culture, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the ECAQA members.

*According to 80.7% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organisation.*

At the end of the visit, the Chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and staff of the educational organisation based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine"**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

###### **1.1 Mission statement**

The mission of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine", which is "to prepare a comprehensively developed, competitive general practitioner with high social responsibility, capable of providing high-quality qualified medical care to the population, combining the latest achievements in the field of education, science and medicine, to learn throughout life and meet the needs and expectations of society", corresponds to the mission of the university - "to prepare highly qualified, scientifically and practically trained, competitive international level personnel-leaders, capable of transforming medical and pedagogical thinking in a changing world, to provide the population with high-quality medical, preventive, rehabilitation care in communication with public health to maintain the health of the nation", and also corresponds to the programme documents in the field of education and healthcare - the Law "On the Protection of Citizens' Health" dated 29.08.1996, the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated 21.06.2017 No. 405 "On measures to further improve the procedure for licensing medical activities"; the Resolution of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated March 29, 2017 No. PP-2857 "On measures to improve the organisation of activities of primary health care institutions of the Republic of Uzbekistan", dated May 5, 2017 No. PP-2956 "On measures to further reform the medical education system in the Republic of Uzbekistan", dated 06.05.2019 No PP-4310 "On measures to further develop the system of medical and pharmaceutical education and science".



In the implementation of the programme activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organisation, members of the advisory body (Academic Council), in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was communicated to potential students through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organisations. The strategic plan of the organisation for the period 2024-2028 was reviewed, including such areas as *Academic development and ensuring high-quality training of competitive personnel; Creation of a research ecosystem; Internationalization of education and research*, which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organisation. From interviews with students, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organisation, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases.

During the visit to the educational organisation's departments, the experts noted the educational organisation's strengths in relation to the accredited educational programme, including:

1. BSMI is implementing a strategy of turning it into an international, research and entrepreneurial institute.
2. Joint educational programmes of double diploma are implemented in cooperation with leading foreign universities.
3. The institute implements international projects, regularly improves the material and technical base.

BSMI has departments that are directly related to the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the presence of the Simulation Educational and Clinical Centre and the Institute Clinic. This conclusion was made, since the Bukhara State Medical Institute has a total area of 82 thousand m<sup>2</sup>, of which 10 buildings are allocated for 3 educational buildings, an educational and simulation centre, an information and resource centre, a library, and an Institute Clinic with 200 beds.

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the mission of the organisation and the mission of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine", and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Uzbekistan (order of the Minister of Secondary Specialized Education of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated October 19, 2021 No. 35-2021 "On approval of the state Standard of the Republic of Uzbekistan" State Standard of Higher Education. Basic Rules "and protocol No. 4 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated 08/31/2021) and current LSI in postgraduate education and healthcare - order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan dated 06/04/2021 No. 121 "On approval of regulatory documents for the organisation of the educational process in medical and pharmaceutical higher educational institutions."

### **1.2 Participation in formulating the mission of the educational programme**

The formulation of the mission of the educational programme "General Medicine" is based on the mission of the institute, the Strategic Plan, and the study of the needs and expectations of stakeholders. The needs and expectations of stakeholders are identified through the processing of requests, feedback from employers regarding the quality of graduates' training, and appeals or property management issues from consumers. According to the self-assessment report, during the development and approval of the mission of the institute and the educational programme, a procedure is applied that involves key stakeholders at different stages, including academic staff, students, and representatives of practical medicine and pharmacy. After the official approval of the educational programme's mission, tutors (academic group curators) include the mission and strategic goals of BSMI in their student engagement plans.

At the same time, during interviews with students and employers, the experts did not receive a clear answer to the questions: "Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the institution and the educational programme?" and "What is your personal contribution to the

improvement of the educational programme?" Students responded that they are familiarized with the mission of the institute and the educational programme, while employers stated that their opinions are taken into account in the formulation of the mission. Nevertheless, the self-assessment report identifies the need for more active involvement of key stakeholders in the formulation of the mission as an area for improvement. Therefore, it is necessary to more broadly involve students and other stakeholders in the development of the educational programme mission (1.2.1) and to consider the opinions of students and the proposals of other stakeholders when formulating the mission (1.2.2).

### **1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom**

BSMI is granted the authority to independently develop and approve educational programmes, taking into account the needs of stakeholders, based on the Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On additional measures to ensure academic, organisational-administrative autonomy of state higher education institutions". The possibility of financial independence provides the authority to allocate resources independently, ensuring the quality of education in accordance with national regulatory legal acts.

The Educational and Methodological Department, together with programme coordinators, conducts regular analysis of the content of disciplines from the standpoint of the formation of graduate competencies and achievements in science and technology, implementation of international and national recommendations, protocols, and standards, and adaptation to healthcare reforms.

To verify **Standard 1**, a meeting was held with the Rector of BSMI, Teshaev Shukhrat Zhumaevich. During the discussion, the experts asked the following questions: What are the expected prospects for the university in the coming years, and what is the vision for their implementation?

In response, the Rector stated that the institute plans to develop the field of oncopathology in collaboration with Chinese partners. In 2026, a Nuclear Medicine Center with radiation therapy is expected to open in cooperation with Uzatom. Additionally, the development of traditional medicine is planned, supported by a grant of 240 million USD implemented jointly with partners from Korea (Daegu Hanny University), Mongolia, and Turkey. Other development plans include smart greenhouses, a pharmaceutical plant (increasing production of medicines from 17 to 50 types), cosmetology, and a regional rehabilitation center (Juzan sanatorium).

As part of the verification process, a survey of 203 students was conducted using the platform <https://webanketa.com/>. Out of 22 questions, several were dedicated to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. It was found that 73% of students would recommend this educational organisation to their acquaintances, friends, or relatives. Furthermore, 90% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational programme and teaching staff are aware of the challenges students face in their studies. In response to the question "Do you think this educational organisation enables you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 77% of students responded positively.

In a separate survey of 352 teaching staff (21 questions), 88% indicated satisfaction with their working conditions and workplace organisation within the educational institution, while 8% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that a healthy working environment exists in the organisation: the management is accessible to both students and staff, responds promptly to inquiries, and holds regular meetings with students. According to the survey, 82% of faculty members are satisfied with the institutional climate, while 3% are partially satisfied. Furthermore, 91% believe that the institution provides opportunities for professional fulfillment in their respective specialties. A total of 352 staff members responded to the survey (out of 600 employed). Among them, 45.2% have up to 5 years of teaching experience, 17.6% have up to 10 years, and 37.2% have more than 10 years of experience.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Of the 11 standards, 9 are fully compliant, 2 are partially compliant, and 0 are not compliant.

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) It is necessary to involve students and other stakeholders more broadly in the development of the educational programme mission (1.2.1).

- 2) When formulating the mission of the educational programme, it is important to take into account the opinions of students and proposals from other stakeholders (1.2.2).

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **2.1 Final learning outcomes of the educational programme**

The final learning outcomes are defined in the form of a list of competencies that are included in the "Qualification requirements for the bachelor's degree in the field of education 60910200 "General medicine". The list of competencies in the EP complies with SCES HE RUz, reflects achievements at the basic level, concerning knowledge of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural, social and clinical sciences; the ability to learn throughout life and the manifestation of professionalism in various functions of a physician in the medical profession. The final results are adapted to the mission of the medical faculty of BSMI.

The final learning outcomes are described in the educational programme passport and at the level of each specific discipline (syllabus, work programme by modules, which provide the competencies required for mastering these disciplines, assessment and methodological materials developed taking into account the qualification requirements). At the same time, it is necessary to develop a system for analysing specific learning outcomes at the end of each part of the training (2.1.5).

*The surveyed teachers answered that 65% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of students, and 27.8% are partially satisfied.*

The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of previous student training (prerequisites) and training in the bachelor's degree, and subsequent continuous professional development programmes. The organisation has developed additional education programmes (internship, master's degree <https://magistr.edu.uz/>., 24 clinical residency programmes <https://bsmi.uz/ariza-beruvchilar-uchun-eslatmaklinik-ordinatura/>), including for the specialty 60910200 "General Medicine". Students are informed about this.

*86% of teacher-respondents believe that students of this educational organisation have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, and 11.4% partially agree with this.*

### **2.2 Organisation and structure of the educational programme**

For the implementation of the EP, a credit-modular training system is used ("Regulations on the implementation of the credit-modular training system at the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino", approved on 08.08.2022).

The modular system, which allows for the sequential study of disciplines in the form of cycles following one another during the semester, is used in the form of cyclic classes in senior years (4-6). The model for studying the EP is integrated, allowing for the interrelations between fundamental and clinical sciences.

To implement the educational programme for 60910200 "General Medicine", the organisation's documents contain educational and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established. While attending practical classes at the departments of biomedical disciplines and at the clinical departments, the experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the class, students answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills. The organisation ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts have studied the Code of Ethics ("On Approval of the Code of Ethics for Medical Personnel" dated March 24, 2022), which is posted on the HEMIS platform in the field of educational content (<https://hemis.bsmi.uz>), and during the interview, students responded that they were informed about the content of this document.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the

bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom. The mentoring system described in the Academic Policy was assessed. Qualification requirements for tutors are higher education, 5 years of experience. A total of 5 tutors (curators), whose tasks are to familiarize with the mission, explain issues of qualification, acquired competencies and the corresponding ones obtained as a result of mastering the educational programme "General Medicine", assist in the formation of the IUP in accordance with the TC, RC and CED; informing about the Safety Rules in accordance with assistance to graduates in employment.

The procedure for informing students about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Regulations "On the Internal Rules" and "On the Rules of Ethical Behaviour" <https://bsmi.uz/talabalar/ichki-tartib-qoidalar/>.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of students. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the document In the internal regulatory document "Internal Rules of BSMI, the organisation does not have an anti-plagiarism system. At the same time, it should be noted that its own EP should be developed taking into account the opinion of students and other stakeholders (2.2.6).

### **2.3 Contents of the educational programme**

Educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine" is based on the strategic educational goals of BSMI and the development strategy of BSMI for 2024-2028. The content of the educational programme includes three main areas: basic biomedical sciences, clinical sciences and skills, as well as relevant behavioural and social sciences. The basic disciplines include subjects that allow you to know and apply the scientific principles and achievements of basic biomedical sciences, know the structure and functions of organs at the level from molecules to cells of organs and the whole organism in health and pathology, taking into account the age characteristics of the patient. The clinical disciplines include disciplines that include the study of public health in all its manifestations: clinical data on diseases, injuries, poisonings, methods of treatment, diagnostics, provision of emergency and planned medical care; study of the public health system, global and national aspects. The total volume of the educational programme is 360 credits. To ensure the content of academic disciplines at all levels of study, syllabi are developed, which are reviewed, analysed in departments, CEPs and approved at a meeting of the IS (Institute Council). The revision and updating of syllabi occurs once a year at the end of the academic year and is approved for the next academic year.

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including the State Compulsory Educational Standard. The dean and staff of the dean's office of the faculty of medicine, the registrar's office, the department for supervision of the quality of education and the educational and methodological department of the institute are responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programmes and the catalogue of elective disciplines of the educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine" have been supplemented and amended (in test questions for the credit, a bank of test tasks for the current and midterm certification, situational problems) based on the articles of the new Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan of 2023, as well as the specifics of R&D and scientific achievements of teachers. The student training programme focuses on key competencies, including effective and safe patient care, which is reflected in the teaching methods (Situation analysis, Patient examination, Clinical case discussion, Patient supervision, Participation in rounds and clinical conferences, Simulation training, standardized patient). The programme content includes issues of patient-oriented care. For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine", the organisation has resources for organizing the assessment of students' practical skills.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 38.9% are completely satisfied.

BSMI has a Specialized Research Centre for Rehabilitation and Health "Zhuyzar", a Dental Scientific and Practical Training Centre and a BSMI Clinic with 200 beds and outpatient visits, where they provide medical care to university employees, students and the attached population of



Bukhara; the structure of the institute's clinic has MRI, MSCT, a laboratory, ECG, CT, ultrasound. BSMI has concluded agreements with 16 medical organisations in Bukhara and the Bukhara region of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

And to the questionnaire question "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 36.9% of students answered with full agreement. At the same time, students claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

The content of elective disciplines is annually reviewed, discussed with the participation of employers in order to adapt to local, regional and national requirements of practical health care. There is a clear connection between the training programme and subsequent professional training. *The surveyed students are completely satisfied with the schedule of classes (39%).*

#### **2.4 Basic biomedical sciences**

The biomedical science disciplines are represented by general theoretical sciences, which enable students to acquire general medical knowledge about the structure and functioning of the human body, primarily in normal and various pathological conditions. These disciplines are considered fundamental sciences and provide the theoretical basis for studying clinical subjects.

During their visit to the departments of biomedical disciplines, the experts observed the following classes (department, topic, instructor's full name, student group):

- Department of Biochemistry: Catabolism of glucose and gluconeogenesis. Importance of the pentose phosphate pathway, taught by Rasulova Y.Z., Amonova N.M., Shukurov I.B., and Sultonova D.B. (2nd year, 5 groups of 26 students, Uzbek language);
- Department of Anatomy and Clinical Anatomy: Conduction pathways of the brain and spinal cord, taught by Radzhabov A.B. (50 students, 2nd year, groups 213–214, General Medicine, Russian language); Bones of the pelvis and lower limbs, taught by Kamalova Sh.M. (12 students, 1st year, group 123, General Medicine, Russian language);
- Department of Pathophysiology: Pathophysiology of anemia, taught by Zaripova O.O. (35 students, English-taught programme, India).

During conversations with students, they expressed a desire to have more contact hours with patients.

#### **2.5 Clinical Sciences**

The syllabi of clinical disciplines and practices are developed in accordance with the principles of evidence-based medicine and are regularly updated in line with changes in clinical guidelines. Students receive training at 10 clinical sites, with which the institution has established agreements outlining the teaching areas and equipment used, thereby enabling full implementation of the educational programme.

The experts observed practical classes in clinical departments at the Institute's Clinic:

- Department of Pediatrics: Perinatal asphyxia. Resuscitation of newborns, taught by Arzieva T.M., Temirov M.T. (GenMed 2nd year, 23 students, English language);
- Department of Propaedeutics of Internal Diseases: Examination methods of patients, taught by Omonov O.Yu. (10 students, 3rd year, English language);
- Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology No. 3: Induction of labor, taught by Suleymanova Gulrukh Suleymanovna (15 students, 3rd year, English language).

Education at BSMI includes early contact of students with patients as part of their early introduction to clinical medicine, starting from the first year. This includes introductory practice aimed at developing initial professional skills in general patient care, as well as basic scientific research skills.

*However, during interviews with 3rd-year students, the experts found that students would like more contact hours with patients.*

*Therefore, it is necessary to provide sufficient time (2.5.1) and ensure early contact with patients (2.5.4) (QIS).*

## **2.6 Scientific Method**

The curriculum prepares students to participate in the implementation of new methods and techniques aimed at protecting the health of citizens, forming knowledge of the basic principles, requirements, algorithm for implementing the results of scientific research, including new methods and techniques aimed at protecting the health of citizens and forming the ability to participate in work on the practical use of new methods and techniques, as well as risk assessment when implementing new methods and techniques aimed at protecting the health of citizens.

## **2.7 Behavioural and Social Sciences and Medical Ethics**

Behavioral and social sciences are studied in parallel with biomedical disciplines. The study of behavioral sciences involves gaining knowledge about the needs of regional healthcare, taking into account regional healthcare programmes as well as the national healthcare system.

The implemented list of behavioral and social sciences, as well as bioethics, based on a competency-based approach, provides the knowledge, concepts, methods, skills, and attitudes necessary to understand the socio-economic, demographic, and cultural determinants of the causes, spread, and consequences of health problems. It also provides knowledge of the national healthcare system and patient rights.

## **2.8 Educational technologies, teaching methods and practical training**

The following educational technologies are used during practical classes: educational video, solving situational problems, business and role-playing educational games, analysis of clinical cases, brainstorming method, small group method, case method, round tables, discussions, duty shifts in departments of the medical base, preparation of medical records, portfolios, work on training simulators. To organize the educational process in clinical disciplines, the capabilities of the BSMI SC are used, which provides simulation training for students to practice practical skills. The Institute has created all the conditions for training using advanced information and communication technologies and modern tools during the educational process. It is necessary to include electronic teaching methods 2.8.2.

## **2.9 Management of the educational programme**

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the department 3 sector of the Registrar's Office and a conversation with the head and staff. Verification of **Standard 2** showed that the activities of the 3 sector are coordinated by the Rector and vice-rectors for academic work, for medical work, for international cooperation, the department for supervision of the quality of education, the department for work with clinical bases. 3 sector The Registrar's Office, together with the dean's office, coordinate and ensure control over the development of all components of the educational programme. The responsibility for organizing the preparation, development of the OP programme and its implementation lies with the dean of the faculty and the Registrar's Office.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including 7 sectors of the office-registrar, held meetings with the heads of the archiving sectors, coordination of the educational process, test centre, electronic document management (HEMIS), marketing, visa centre, during the cross-interview it was established that the opening of educational areas is constantly monitored by a working group organized by the educational and methodological department (Registrar's Office), which includes department heads, deans, teaching staff, employers and members of the primary organisation of the Youth Union.

While visiting a practical lesson in the Simulation Centre and talking with students, the experts saw that the organisation promotes the development of practical competencies of students, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, students deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

## **2.10 Connection with medical practice and the health care system**

The training of students in the specialty 60910200 "General medicine" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical health care. The institute has a division responsible for organizing both direct postgraduate education (residency), and the Centre for Advanced Training of Academic Staff of



Professional Education, the Faculty of Postgraduate Education, the Department of Retraining and Advanced Training of Family Doctors. One of the tasks of the divisions is constant interaction with the regional administration, practical health care in order to assess the need for specialists in certain specialties. In addition to specialized departments that train specialists only at the postgraduate level, the following departments simultaneously train both students and residents at the BSMI: otolaryngology, ophthalmology, neurology and neurosurgery, forensic medicine, hospital therapy, paediatrics, hospital surgery, obstetrics and gynaecology. This allows the Academic staff to ensure operational communication between basic medical education and the subsequent stage of professional training of a specialist.

Thus, during a conversation with the organisation's management, expert teachers and a review of the Institute's Clinic, information was obtained that student training is carried out directly in the clinical departments, each department has training rooms. Students of this specialty can supervise patients in the disciplines of paediatrics, general surgery, general practitioners, obstetrics and gynaecology. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in the organisation.

*Of the 203 students surveyed, 70% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Of 38 standards, 34 comply fully, 4 partially, 0 do not comply.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To develop a system for analysing specific learning outcomes at the end of each part of the training (2.1.5).
- 2) The educational programme should be developed taking into account the views of students and other stakeholders (2.2.6).
- 3) The educational programme should provide for sufficient time (2.5.1) and early contact with patients (2.5.4 QSI).
- 4) To include methods using IT technologies and electronic programmes in the teaching methods (2.8.2).

### **Standard 3: STUDENT ASSESSMENT**

#### **3.1 Assessment policy and system**

The student assessment system is described in the “Regulations on the implementation of the credit-modular education system at the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino” <https://bsmi.uz/baholash-nizomi/>, as well as in the “Regulations on the assessment of students according to the credit-modular system” by each department and approved by the vice-rector of the institute for academic affairs. The performance assessment policy is reflected in the syllabus for disciplines. Since the 2020/2021 academic year, the institute has switched to filling out electronic journals on the HEMIS platform (<https://hemis.bsmi.uz>), where student assessments are recorded for all types of control and the admission rating and final exam score are automatically calculated.

The study of control and measurement tools showed that the organisation has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of students' academic achievements. Assessment of academic achievements is carried out on the basis of accepted measures. During each practical lesson, during the current assessment of knowledge, skills and abilities in the discipline, testing, discussion of the main sections of the topic, completion of the practical part, and solution of situational problems are carried out. The system of monitoring academic achievements includes: current, midterm and final monitoring of students' academic performance and final state certification and primary accreditation.

It is relevant to develop scientific and methodological foundations for assessing the achievements and performance of students in the form of measuring their competencies, the main

indicator characterizing a student as a competent person and showing his or her level of training. In this regard, it is necessary to provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (BS 3.1.4).

Students can read the instructions for the system of assessment of academic achievements on the website of the institute <https://bsmi.uz/baholash-nizomi/>. The assessment policy should also be presented in all languages of instruction (3.1.6).

During the interview, students talked about the forms of assessment, and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the "Regulations on the implementation of the credit-modular system of education at the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino" and during the period of work of the educational organisation there were no precedents of appeal. The system of assessment of academic achievements of students at BSMI provides for the possibility of filing an appeal in case of disagreement of the student with the assessment results. The appeal is considered and a corresponding conclusion is given within 3 days from the date of receipt of the appeal application.

Thus, to verify the **Standard 3**, data, the experts asked questions to the head of the office registrar and the test center and checked the documents and methods for assessing students. The organisation has tests, control questions for each module, an objectively systematized clinical examination (OSCE), an objectively systematized examination (OSE), which are compiled on the basis of the criteria specified in the "Regulations on the implementation of the credit-modular training system at the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali ibn Sino" dated 08.08.2022 and approved at a meeting, discussed and approved by the Academic Council, which, in addition to scientific and pedagogical workers, includes students and leading specialists of the regional health authorities. The funds of assessment tools are subject to cross-analysis of the clinical departments of the institute, as well as with the involvement of practical health workers. The head of the education department replied that the methods of assessing exams are adjusted annually to eliminate the identified deficiencies.

During the visit to the organisation and the interview with the head of the office-registrar Rakhmatov O.B., the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, contracts with teachers and students. In the sectors of the office-registrar - registration, archiving and coordination of the educational process, educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates, and certificates are registered, archived and coordinated in the educational process. Each student can see their grades at any time in their personal account HEMIS. Students can read the instructions for the system of assessing academic achievements on the institute's website <https://bsmi.uz/baholash-nizomi/>

### **3.2 Assessment that promotes and supports learning (formative assessment)**

BSMI has a working group consisting of leading teachers and student representatives that analyses the use of various methods of assessing students and prepares proposals for their improvement.

The results of student assessment are documented in the electronic journal of registration of academic performance and attendance of students, the results of midterm assessment are reflected in the examination/credit report (transferred to the student office), in the electronic department journal, and are posted in the student's record book.

When interviewing teachers and students regarding assessment methods, experts received answers about the timeliness of providing tests, conducting consultations before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, specialized types of exams at the Simulation Centre: OSCE in core disciplines and OSCE in basic disciplines.

The interviewed employer representatives also pointed out the compliance of graduates' training with the modern development of medical practice and science. The employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of students. However, the educational organisation did not conduct systematic feedback with them. It is necessary to provide a system of formative assessment for regular feedback to students with the identification of strengths and weaknesses (3.2.1)

### **3.3 Assessment that facilitates decision-making (summative assessment)**

The Institute has developed and implemented an assessment system that is important for summarizing the results of training (summative assessment). The results of knowledge assessment are recorded in the electronic system and are available to students on the day of assessment in the Hemis programme. Constant feedback on academic performance is ensured between the teacher and students. Summative assessment is carried out through midterm, current and final controls, during the period of midterm and final state certification. The forms and methods of summative assessment are determined by the department/module, taking into account the specifics of the discipline.

### **3.4 Quality Control**

The Institute has mechanisms to ensure the quality of the assessment procedure and methods. The main tools of this mechanism are planning and implementation of the educational process (the content of curricula, programmes, distribution of study time, technologies and teaching methods). The Institute has a department for quality control of education, whose responsibilities include an analytical study of the work plans of faculties, departments and specialized divisions,

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria** out of 14 standards: fully - 11, partially - 3, do not comply - 0.

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (3.1.4).
- 2) The assessment policy should be presented in all languages of instruction (3.1.6).
- 3) To provide regular feedback to students on the methods and results of formative assessment, as well as identify strengths and weaknesses to improve formative assessment (3.2.1).

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **4.1 Student selection and admission policy**

The student admission policy is developed in accordance with the Law “On Education of the Republic of Uzbekistan” No. 637 dated September 23, 2020, and the “Regulation on the Procedure for Admission to Undergraduate Programs of Higher Educational Institutions” (Annex 1 to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 393 dated June 20, 2017). The policy is reviewed annually by the Academic Council and approved by an order of the Rector of the Institute.

The work of the Admissions Committee is regulated by the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 393 dated June 20, 2017, “On Approval of the Regulation on Admission, Transfer, Reinstatement, and Expulsion of Students in Higher Educational Institutions,” as well as by the Presidential Decree “On the Organization of Admission to State Higher Educational Institutions”.

The admission policy and procedures at BSMI are specific, aligned with the mission and objectives of the institute, officially published, and accessible to all interested parties via <https://bsmi.uz/ru/novosti-priemnoj-komissii-2/>, <https://bsmi.uz/ru/proczedura-priema/>, and also on the website [www.edu.uz](http://www.edu.uz).

The number of admitted students is regulated according to the Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 60 dated June 15, 2022, "On the Parameters of the State Admission Quota to State Higher Educational Institutions for the 2022/2023 Academic Year," as well as the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan for the training of medical

personnel. It takes into account the institute's capacity for educational, clinical, and practical training, the maximum permissible faculty workload, the availability of educational, methodological, and scientific literature, classroom and lab capacity, clinical training bases, and material and technical resources. During the period from 2016 to 2022, a total of 7,981 students were admitted to the educational programme in the specialty of "General Medicine," and 2,086 successfully completed their studies. Thus, the experts validated the data under **Standard 4**.

The experts reviewed the student admission documentation, including the document "On the Approval of the Regulation on the Procedure for Admission, Transfer, Reinstatement, and Expulsion of Students in Higher Educational Institutions", approved by the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 393 dated June 20, 2017, as well as the Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On the Organization of Admission to State Higher Educational Institutions". Admission of applicants within the admission quotas and outside the quotas on the basis of tuition agreements approved by the relevant decision of the President or the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan is carried out by the State Commission in accordance with the procedure established by the aforementioned resolution.

The institute implements a policy of balanced student enrollment, taking into account gender, ethnic origin, and other social factors. In general, all criteria are met. However, some shortcomings have been identified. For example, it is necessary to ensure the involvement of students in the development of the admission policy (4.1.3 QIS); to incorporate the institute's own admission criteria aligned with its stated mission and intended learning outcomes (4.1.4 QIS); and to revise the admission policy based on input from professional communities (4.1.7).

Regarding the practice of academic advising, personal student support, and the development of not only professional but also soft skills, the experts interviewed faculty and students. The institution has a student development programme as well as a system of academic mobility for both faculty and students, allowing students to study at any university in Uzbekistan and abroad.

#### **4.2 Student Counselling and Support**

The institute provides its students with a wide range of support services, including academic, social, psychological, financial, and career counseling.

There are dedicated services in place to provide emergency assistance to students and staff in cases of personal psychological trauma or critical situations. A support and guidance system for students in educational programmes is also in operation, including the Youth Union, Career Center, Communicative Competence Development Center, Tutor Service, Women's Committee, Center for Social, Financial and Psychological Support, and the Graduate Employment Marketing Center.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Of the 16 standards met: fully - 13, partially - 3, do not meet - 0

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) Consider the possibility of including students in the process of developing the admissions policy (4.1.3 QIS).
- 2) Introduce own criteria into the admissions policy in connection with the stated mission and expected learning outcomes (4.1.4 QIS).
- 3) Ensure that the admissions policy is revised taking into account the opinion of professional communities (4.1.7).

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF**

#### **5.1 Policy on the formation of academic staff**

The personnel policy of the institute is implemented in accordance with the "Law on Education", the Labour Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 20 dated February 10, 2006 "On the Approval of the Regulation on the Procedure for the Competitive Recruitment of Academic Staff to Higher Educational Institutions" <https://lex.uz/docs/973534>, the Charter of BSMI, the BSMI Development Strategy for



2024–2028, the Internal Regulations of BSMI, and the BSMI Code of Ethics.

In selecting candidates for academic positions, the institute considers the level of qualification, professional experience, research achievements, and the ability to ensure the training of highly qualified specialists in accordance with current requirements. The personnel policy implemented ensures a balance between full-time and part-time teaching staff. Evaluation of the academic, pedagogical, and clinical achievements of the teaching staff is conducted based on their individual work plans. Staff incentives are regulated by the Regulation on Employee Remuneration and the Regulation on the Rating-Based Quality Control of BSMI Faculty Performance.

The total number of employees is 701, of whom 600 are full-time faculty members, and 101 are part-time.

To verify the data for Standard 5, the external experts collected faculty opinions regarding the personnel policy. Since 2020, the institute has been actively implementing an academic mobility programme for students, which enables the acquisition and application of advanced international experience, expansion of professional, pedagogical, and clinical knowledge and skills, discussion and implementation of project ideas, and strengthening of the institute's reputation. During the 2021–2022 academic year, 146 staff members underwent professional development and retraining: 139 within the country and 7 abroad. In the 2022–2023 academic year, 152 staff members completed professional development and retraining courses: 142 domestically and 10 abroad.

*According to the results of a faculty survey, the majority (88%) are fully satisfied with the organisation of work and their workplaces at the educational institution, while 8% are partially satisfied. A total of 89% fully agree that they have the opportunity to conduct scientific research and publish their results; 7% partially agree. Satisfaction with the work of the HR (personnel) department was reported by 72% of respondents (fully agree), while 18% are partially satisfied. Regarding salaries, 78% are fully satisfied, and 3.7% are partially satisfied.*

## **5.2 Academic activity and professional ethics of teachers**

The institute's personnel policy ensures appropriate recognition of all types of teaching staff activities. Based on the results of their educational-methodological, research, and clinical work, the institute applies various forms of material and non-material incentives, motivation, and career advancement for staff in recognition of their achievements in educational and professional areas. Monitoring of the fulfillment of faculty members' duties is carried out by the head of department, dean of the faculty, the Educational and Methodological Department, and the Department for Quality Control in Education through the supervision of the implementation of individual work plans and department work plans.

The procedure for employee incentives is defined by the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 517 dated August 26, 2020, "On the Approval of the Regulation on the Procedure for Financial Incentives for Professors, Teachers, and Other Categories of Employees of Higher Educational Institutions of the Republic Using Off-Budget Funds" <https://lex.uz/docs/4969845>.

During the period from 2021 to 2023, 60 faculty members were awarded the academic title of Professor of BSMI, and 280 were awarded the academic title of Associate Professor of BSMI.

## **5.3 Continuous professional development of academic staff**

The institute implements a staff development policy that includes the training, support, and evaluation of teaching staff. BSMI carries out an academic mobility programme for both students and teaching staff, including within the framework of joint educational programmes.

To verify the data under Standard 5, during meetings with the Head of the HR Department and interviews with faculty members, experts received opinions regarding approaches to the development of teaching competencies, motivation for working with students, and the implementation of mentoring. Experts also obtained information about the faculty professional development programme. Annual training plans are developed for academic and administrative staff. The training and professional development of academic staff are conducted through short-term seminars, courses,

and internships at leading institutions and medical organisations. In 2021, 47 faculty members completed professional development training in their specialty. In 2022, this number was 73, and in 2023, it increased to 127. These activities are financed by the university.

Experts found that faculty members initiate research topics for students, stimulate the need for additional learning, and encourage independent work with literature and medical documentation. During student vacations, faculty members participate in seminars on topics such as: use of the Hemis system; updates and challenges in higher education; project grant application preparation; requirements for scientific publications and patent registration; development of student competencies; promotion of spiritual and educational activities within the institute; education without corruption; modern teaching approaches and pedagogical technologies; and the use of ICT in science and education.

*The organisation offers opportunities for career growth and competence development for faculty members—91% of surveyed instructors agreed, and 7% partially agreed. Regarding participation in professional development programmes, 70% had received training less than one year ago, while 9% did not respond.*

*The educational institution also implements social support programmes for academic staff—75% of respondents confirmed the existence of such programmes, 3.9% stated they had already benefited from them, 1% responded that such programmes do not exist, and 17% were unaware of their existence.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Compliant out of 10 standards: fully -10.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Material and technical base for teaching and learning**

The material and technical resources for the implementation of the "General Medicine" educational programme include premises, equipment, information and communication tools, including the library, office equipment, and methodological resources.

A total of 17 departments are involved in the implementation of the "General Medicine" educational programme, located both in the main buildings of the Institute and across 5 clinical bases.

In accordance with allocated funding, the Institute regularly updates its furniture, acquires hard and soft inventory, computer and office equipment, stationery, mannequins, phantoms, laboratory and medical equipment, consumables, and other necessary items (the most recent purchase of mannequins was made in 2023). With the opening of the new Simulation Center, there have been significant improvements in equipment and available space. Compared to previous years, the number of classrooms has increased, and the Institute's administration has additionally purchased more than 128 robotic mannequins with a total value of 22.1 billion UZS. Currently, the Simulation Center is equipped with more than 80 types of equipment.

The BSMI Simulation Center includes the following educational blocks: intensive care, surgery, operating room, pediatric intensive care, obstetrics, gynecology, two rooms for anatomy classes, traumatology, a room for disaster medicine, and two rooms equipped with 50 microscopes, which are highly beneficial for the departments of histology, microbiology, and pathological anatomy.

The experts visited the following sessions at the Department of Clinical Skills Training using simulators (instructor's name, group):

- Percussion, lung auscultation, peak flowmetry (Soliev A.U., 10 students, 3rd year, Uzbek group);
- Stages of putting on a sterile gown and sterile gloves (Safoev B.B., 10 students, 3rd year, Uzbek group);
- Hearing loss assessment (whisper and conversational speech), otoscopy, anterior rhinoscopy (Narzulloev N.U., 9 students, 3rd year, Uzbek group);



- Intrauterine device (IUD) insertion (Khasanova M.T., 9 students, 3rd year, Uzbek group);
- External obstetric examination, estimation of fetal weight (Kadirbaeva M.T., 12 students, 2nd year, Uzbek group);
- Blood pressure measurement, pulse examination, body mass index calculation (Ismoilova F.Sh., 12 students, 2nd year, Uzbek group).

## **6.2 Resources for clinical training**

BSMI possesses the necessary resources to organize clinical training, including a sufficient number of patients and clinical training bases for future specialists in hospitals, outpatient clinics, city medical centers, and other healthcare organisations to ensure that students receive adequate clinical education.

BSMI operates the Specialized Research Center for Rehabilitation and Health "Zhuyzar", the BSMI Dental Scientific and Practical Training Center, and the BSMI Clinic with a capacity of 200 beds. BSMI has signed agreements with 16 medical organisations in the city of Bukhara and the Bukhara region of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

A review of resources confirmed that they are aligned with the goals and objectives of the educational process. The BSMI Clinic serves both adult and pediatric populations, allowing students to gain extensive knowledge and hands-on experience using modern medical equipment (diagnostic rooms, rehabilitation units, physiotherapy rooms, etc.). The following centers operate within the BSMI Clinic: the Center for Neurosurgery and Orthopedics, Departments of Otorhinolaryngology and Maxillofacial Surgery, Departments of Cerebrovascular Pathology and the Pediatric Rehabilitation Center, Departments of Multidisciplinary Therapy and Cardiology, the Center for Reproductive Health and Screening, Departments of Transplantology and Cardiac Surgery.

The educational institution's staff maintains collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel and the management of clinical training bases to ensure students achieve desired learning outcomes. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment, and their accessibility to students are ensured. Staff members who serve as both educators and tutors (mentors) deliver quality teaching while adhering to ethical and deontological standards. Prior to the start of each subject within the educational programme, students receive a syllabus from their instructor, clearly outlining the skills they are expected to acquire and develop during the course.

During visits to the clinical bases, experts assessed the resources, their alignment with the curriculum, and their availability to faculty and students, as well as the modernity of the equipment and its relevance to students' needs and practical healthcare requirements. Experts obtained evidence confirming compliance with Standard 6 and validated the information presented in the self-assessment report.

For the purpose of validating the information provided in the self-assessment report and obtaining evidence regarding the quality of the programmes, an interview was conducted with students of the specialty. The experts asked questions about student satisfaction with the education, the adequacy of time allocated for patient supervision and working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and faculty qualifications, social and moral support for students in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", and access to international professional literature databases.

Overall, the students expressed satisfaction with the education, assessment methods, and stated that they had purposefully chosen this educational institution, as they believed it has strong resources, a good reputation, and international connections. At the same time, students noted that they would like to have more independence in managing patients and organizing international events.

The students demonstrated their commitment to the educational organisation, were active in responding to questions from external experts, and shared their views on the organisation of education, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, and funding. They also demonstrated English language proficiency when answering questions from the international expert, Professor Laszlo Csiba. The experts reviewed student documents, including portfolios, student assessment results (checklists), and survey results.

*Students have free access to patients at clinical bases and all necessary conditions for improving their practical skills — 89% of faculty members fully agreed with this statement, 6.8% partially agreed, and 1.9% found it difficult to respond.*

### **6.3 Research in the field of medicine and scientific achievements**

The Institute conducts scientific research in the field of medicine, including for the purpose of integrating the obtained data into the educational programme. Scientific research is a priority for BSMI. The strategic development programmes of BSMI (2024–2028) include a project aimed at improving research and innovation activities. As part of the university's transformation into a research-oriented institution, a Shared Research Center will be established, where modern research laboratories will be launched.

The Institute has established centers of scientific and technological excellence in the following areas: genetic and molecular epidemiology, experimental medicine, general pathology, physiology, and an experimental biological clinic.

Within the overarching BSMI research theme titled "Early detection, diagnosis, and development of new methods for treatment and prevention of pathological factors affecting the health of the population in the Bukhara oasis during the post-COVID period", 5 specific research areas have been defined: Maternal and child health protection; Issues of surgical diseases; Issues of therapeutic diseases; Problems in biomedical sciences; Problems in preventive medicine sciences. Over the past 3 years, the Institute has implemented eight scientific projects (research and technology programmes, or RTP), including those funded by state grants, and three independent research initiatives. A total of 12 departments and 40 faculty members involved in the implementation of the educational programme have participated in research activities. In 2023, the Institute carried out 9 RTP involving 10 faculty members and staff.

Interviews with full-time faculty members revealed both achievements and challenges in managing education, which depend on the specific clinical base (e.g., access of students to equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical documentation, and opportunities for independent work).

### **6.4 Information resources**

The Strategic Development Programme of the Institute for 2024–2028 includes subprograms aimed at enhancing digital competencies among both faculty members and students, as well as the development of digital educational complexes using digital tools and various digital platforms. To implement informatization, the Institute has established and operates several structures: the Informatization Center, the Testing Center, and the Information Policy Center.

The Institute provides access to electronic resources from display classrooms and the library, offering opportunities to access both global Internet resources and internal electronic and library resources. The website [www.book.bsmi.uz](http://www.book.bsmi.uz) hosts 2,269 textbooks and teaching aids in medicine, each with a QR code — as part of the SMART BOOK challenge. In the future, it is planned to expand the use of medical information systems in the educational process, particularly for students' independent work. *At the same time, there is a need to ensure access to international sources and equipment, as well as subscriptions to electronic educational resources (6.4.3 BS).*

### **6.5 Expertise in the field of education**

The university has established a practice of conducting educational programme expertise, functioning as a continuous cycle of internal and external quality assessment and evaluation. Internal monitoring of the quality of the "General Medicine" educational programme is carried out with an evaluation of the programme's content, taking into account key competencies and intended learning outcomes. External evaluation of the programme is conducted by the State Inspectorate for Supervision of Quality in Education.

The curriculum and course syllabi are periodically reviewed, updated, and adjusted. All course syllabi are discussed by department faculty and undergo internal peer review by the professors and associate professors of the institute. The content of elective and optional course syllabi includes specific features of regional healthcare.

The expertise includes analysis of the demand for specialists and teaching methods, and the results allow conclusions to be drawn regarding the quality of innovations in postgraduate education. For example, staff incentive issues are regulated by the Regulation on Employee Remuneration and the Regulation on the Rating-Based Quality Control of BSMI Faculty Performance. Scientific and academic staff receive bonuses for outstanding achievements in scientific and methodological activities.

#### **6.6 Exchange in the field of education**

Staff of the International Department and university administration are involved in establishing and maintaining international relations, as well as signing cooperation agreements. The institute has partnerships with 208 universities across 32 countries. Each agreement is assigned to a responsible department head and academic unit.

To carry out international activities, the institute has a Vice-Rector for International Cooperation who oversees the International Department and the International Faculty. BSMI implements 20 dual-degree programmes with universities, including those ranked in the top 500, from countries such as Russia, Poland, Turkey, and Kazakhstan. Special attention is also given to the Visiting Professors Programme, which involves experts from leading universities and medical institutions.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Compliant out of 21 standards: fully - 20, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To provide students with broad access to international sources and equipment, subscriptions to electronic educational resources (6.4.3).

### **Standard 7: QUALITY ASSURANCE**

#### **7.1 Quality Assurance System**

Monitoring of educational programmes and the results of their development is carried out on the basis of regulatory provisions on the main professional educational programme (EP), on the work programme, on the credit-modular system, the point-rating system, on the state final certification. The Educational and Methodological Department (Registrar's Office) is responsible for regular monitoring of the educational programme.

BSMI as a structural unit has a department for quality control of education, on staff 4 employees: the head of the department and 3 chief specialists. The requirements for these positions are defined in the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers No. 515 dated 18.07.2017 of the State Inspectorate for Supervision of the Quality of Education <https://lex.uz/docs/3273612>. The purpose of this department is to create and maintain the quality of education, which will contribute to the development of the institute and will make it possible to achieve a high rating both within the country (in the lists of the national rating system) and in international rating lists (in QS, THE and ARWU). The Department of Education Quality Control is based on a clear definition of the functions of all officials, employees and their relationship in the performance of their functions, including responsibilities and rights. Guarantees of education quality are provided by the corresponding organisational structure of the quality system of the educational organisation.

#### **7.2 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating the programme**

At the institute, the internal quality system is ensured on a regular basis. In accordance with the roadmap of the department, which is approved for each new academic year, it is planned to conduct analyses of the activities of divisions and departments. In the process of preparation, an analysis of the current situation is carried out, working groups are created to assess the quality of education and, with the approval of the rector of the institute, it is approved by order. Also, on the website of the institute you can find Google format questionnaires for students, graduates, teachers, employers and parents of students.

The Institute, together with the State Inspectorate for the Quality of Education, conducts an annual survey of students in order to assess their level of satisfaction with their studies at the University. General management of the procedure for assessing student satisfaction with the quality of educational activities is carried out by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs together with the Head of the Department for Quality Control of Education. Direct work with respondents is assigned to the deans' offices and departments of the Institute.

### **7.3 Feedback from teachers and students**

For feedback, the Institute uses various tools, in particular, a sociological survey of teachers and students is regularly conducted in the following areas: 1) student satisfaction with the quality of the educational process at BSMI; 2) student satisfaction with the quality of teaching disciplines at BSMI (if necessary, in particular, elective disciplines); 3) teacher satisfaction with their work at the Institute. The results are summarized and analysed by the Department for Supervision of the Quality of Education of the Institute and are provided to the entire staff (minutes of the extended academic council of the Institute on this issue).

The Institute has a department for the management of the compliance control and anti-corruption system, which is engaged in anti-corruption activities, analysing information on the risks of non-compliance with the requirements of the law, regulatory documents, violations by teachers and students. Meetings of law enforcement officials with students (supporting documents) are held regularly.

### **7.4 Academic achievements of students and graduates**

A system of support and encouragement of students by assigning state personal scholarships and the state scholarship of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, assigned to students in order to stimulate and (or) support their mastering of the relevant educational programmes and disciplines, has been developed and is in effect. Thus, over the past five years, 8 students of the institute received the state scholarship named after the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, 6 students received the state scholarship named after Islam Karimov and 2 students received the state scholarship named after Ibn Sina. In addition, 18 students received scholarships from the Association of Doctors of Uzbekistan. 1 student received a patent for an invention.

### **7.5 Stakeholder involvement**

One of the criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of the "General Medicine" educational programme is the performance indicators of graduates during final certification. Test questions or examinations are adjusted based on recommendations from the State Certification Commissions, as well as analysis of feedback from students and employers. Specialists from medical centers in the Bukhara region are involved in conducting final state certification exams for graduates in clinical sciences. The invited experts play a significant role in reviewing and assessing thematic questions.

Proposals regarding the organisation of students' clinical training, the adequacy of clinical resources, patient availability, and professional development of physicians are regularly reviewed, discussed, and addressed during meetings of the Faculty Coordination Council and the Institute Council.

Employer interviews were conducted offline and included questions such as: awareness of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, involvement in advisory bodies, satisfaction with students' basic knowledge and skills, participation in student training through mentoring, provision of necessary resources to departments and students for practical training and clinical thinking development, challenges in collaboration with departments and the university as a whole, and the employment rate of graduates.

At the same time, stakeholders should be involved in the programme monitoring and evaluation activities (Standard 7.5.1 BS); it is also necessary to collect and study feedback on the quality of the educational programme from other stakeholders (Standard 7.5.2 QIS).

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Compliance out of 14 standards: fully - 12, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.



Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) Involve stakeholders in the monitoring programme and activities for evaluating the educational programme (7.5.1).
- 2) Ensure the collection and study of feedback on the quality of the educational programme from different groups of stakeholders (7.5.2 QIS).

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Management**

The Institute is managed in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Model Rules for the Activities of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education Organizations and the Charter of the Institute <https://bsmi.uz/institut-nizomi/> on the principles of one-man management and collegiality. The management structure of BSMI is determined in accordance with the requirements for training personnel of higher and postgraduate medical education. The Rector of the Institute is the managing person and acts on behalf of the university, represents the Institute and its interests in all bodies, on the basis of legislation, internal regulations and the Charter of the Institute. The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs ensures planning, organisation and control of the educational and educational-methodical work of the structural units subordinate to him. The Vice-Rector for Research and Innovation Work carries out general management of scientific and innovative activities, is responsible for the development of policy, a strategic development plan for science. The Vice-Rector for Youth Affairs, Spiritual and Educational Work supervises educational activities.

The Institute has developed the following regulatory documents for the functioning of its departments: Internal Rules; Regulations on the procedure for assessing students' knowledge; Rules for organizing the educational process in the Master's programme; Rules for admission to the Institute; Regulations on the implementation of the credit-modular education system; Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final certification of students; Regulations on the qualification practice of undergraduate and graduate students; Regulations on granting academic leave to students; Rules for conducting final state certification of students; Regulations on the transfer and reinstatement of students.

All documents related to the activities of the University and the Academic staff are documented by relevant protocols and orders and are communicated to all interested parties personally, by sending them via the electronic platform (<https://edo.ijro.uz>) or posting them on the website. Execution is monitored via the electronic platform (<https://edo.ijro.uz>).

*In response to the survey question "Do the organisation's management listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work?", 75% of teachers responded that they do so systematically, 14% responded "sometimes," 2.5% "rarely," and 1% "never."*

### **8.2 Representation of students and academic staff**

Student self-government bodies at the legislative level have a wide range of rights and opportunities to participate in university management, namely: participation in faculty and institutional academic councils, organisation and implementation of scientific, cultural, sports, health-related and other events, as well as assistance in student employment.

The student self-government system operates at three levels: the Strategic level (Youth Union, Student Section of the Trade Union Committee), Student Self-Government of the Faculties, and Student Self-Government in Dormitories.

The institute has an active Youth Union. All students and staff under the age of 30 can become members. Currently, the number of students and staff in the institute's Youth Union is 6,743 people, 9,598 of whom are in the "General Medicine" programme. The Union includes a total of 7 departments. Additionally, the Youth Union has a volunteer center, a student council, and a student fund council.

### **8.3 Administration**

The management policy of BSMI, procedures and rules, organisational and administrative structure of BSMI are aligned with the mission, strategic goals, and objectives, ensure the effectiveness of institutional relationships and the integrity of the institute, and create and maintain conditions for achieving the goals of teaching, acquiring and expanding professional knowledge and skills, conducting scientific research and creative activities for both the academic staff and students, clinical residents, masters and doctoral students.

#### **8.4 Budget for training and resource allocation**

To create appropriate conditions, an annual income and expenditure estimate is developed, which includes the revenues and expenses expected to be incurred in the current year. This estimate includes expenditures for the higher education institution. The target budget allocated by the main service provider is determined based on actual student enrollment data.

BSMI operates based on founding documents such as the certificate of state registration, statistical registration card, certificate of registration with the tax authority, charter, state license for conducting educational activities in technical and vocational, secondary specialized, higher, and postgraduate education, and a state license for conducting medical and clinical activities.

Annually, the authorized body approves a 3-year budget request with allocation of the state order. Based on this budget request, funds for the current year are allocated by budget programmes.

#### **8.5 Interaction with the healthcare sector**

BSMI is actively implementing the tasks specified in the Concept for the Development of the Healthcare System of the Republic of Uzbekistan for 2019 - 2025. The main medical and demographic indicators in the region are monitored monthly. Action plans for improving the provision of medical care are regularly discussed at boards and meetings with leading specialists in the region. Based on the analysis of demographic indicators in the region, scientific programmes are developed to reduce mortality from socially significant diseases. Doctors are trained on current issues of primary health care, specialized and high-tech care to improve their skills. Consultative teams with leading professors and associate professors of clinical departments regularly visit rural areas. Over the past 3 years, the faculty of the institute has examined 2,100 residents of 19 districts and cities of the Bukhara region.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Comply out of 17 standards: fully - 17, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The Institute, openly positioning itself as a university ready for positive changes, constantly monitors and strategically analyses the changing internal and external environment. The organisational management structure of BSMI is regularly reviewed in accordance with the reform processes in the field of higher education and healthcare of the Republic of Uzbekistan, changes in the practice of global educational management. In recent years, due to the growth in the number of students and teachers, the infrastructure of the Belarusian State Medical Institute has been significantly expanded, including the introduction of its own educational and clinical base, new laboratories, expansion of the classroom fund, updating and purchasing equipment, and mechanisms for integrating new technologies in the educational process are being formed as they appear. Every year, the heads of educational programmes and structural divisions involved in the implementation of the educational process provide information on the implementation of planned activities at meetings of various advisory bodies, which is reflected in the minutes. Thus, by 2028, the existing educational, scientific, laboratory, and clinical base will be expanded through the acquisition of research equipment and the creation of laboratory complexes and pilot industrial bases.

Since 2024, it is planned to implement additional educational programmes in priority sectors of the economy (such as Major and Minor) and applied bachelor's degree programmes. Distance learning programmes will be developed for citizens of target countries. By 2028, 1 educational programme for inclusive education will be developed. The quality criteria for educational



programmes will be the presence of modern professional and IT competencies in graduates, the presence of practical work skills, decision-making and the ability to create their own business.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Compliant out of 3 standards: fully - 3, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Thus, during the external assessment of the educational programme, out of **144 standards for accreditation** compliance was established for 128 standards for accreditation, including 114 basic standards (92.7%) and 14 improvement standards (66.7%). Partially fulfilled 16 standards, including 12 basic standards (7%) and 4 improvement standards (33%). No non-compliance with standards was found.

## **6. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme 60910200 "General Medicine":**

1) It is necessary to involve students and other stakeholders more widely in developing the mission of the educational programme (1.2.1).

2) While formulating the mission of the educational programme, take into account the opinions of students and suggestions of other stakeholders (1.2.2).

3) To develop a system for analysing specific learning outcomes at the end of each part of the training (2.1.5).

4) The educational programme should be developed taking into account the opinions of students and other stakeholders (2.2.6).

5) The educational programme should provide for sufficient time (2.5.1) and early contact with patients (2.5.4 QIS).

6) To include methods using IT technologies and electronic programmes in the teaching methods (2.8.2).

7) To provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (3.1.4).

8) The assessment policy should be presented in all languages of instruction (3.1.6).

9) To provide regular feedback to students on the methods and results of formative assessment, as well as identify strengths and weaknesses to improve formative assessment (3.2.1).

10) Consider the possibility of including students in the process of developing the admissions policy (4.1.3 QIS).

11) Introduce own criteria into the admissions policy in connection with the stated mission and expected learning outcomes (4.1.4 QIS).

12) Ensure that the admissions policy is revised taking into account the opinion of professional communities (4.1.7).

13) To provide students with broad access to international sources and equipment, subscriptions to electronic educational resources (6.4.3).

14) Involve stakeholders in the monitoring programme and activities for evaluating the educational programme (7.5.1).

15) Ensure the collection and study of feedback on the quality of the educational programme from different groups of stakeholders (7.5.2 QIS).

### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established that the educational programme "General Medicine" of the Bukhara State Medical Institute named after Abu Ali Ibn Sino complies with the Standards of Specialized Accreditation and reached a unanimous decision to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this organisation for a period of **5 years**.

	Full name	Signature
EEC Chairperson	Yusupov Rustam Rakhimovich	
International expert	Dr. Csiba László Mihály	
Academic Expert	Mamarajabov Sobirjon Ergashevich	
Academic Expert	Shokirov Shokhrukh Tolibekovich	
Academic Expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	
Academic Expert	Almabayeva Aigul Ydyrisovna	
Academic Expert	Baskakova Irina Valentinovna	
Expert- Employer	Sattarova Dilorom Salomovna	
Expert - representative of Students	Nasimova Madina Zarifovna	
Expert - representative of Students	Khankhildiev Daler Vyacheslavovich	

**Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы  
60910200 «General Medicine» (обобщение)**

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС/СУ*	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	<b>МИССИЯ И ЦЕННОСТИ</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11/ 0</b>	<b>9 / 0</b>	<b>2</b>	
2.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>33/5</b>	<b>32 / 1</b>	<b>4/1</b>	
3.	<b>ОЦЕНКА СТУДЕНТОВ</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>12/ 2</b>	<b>9 / 2</b>	<b>3/0</b>	
4.	<b>СТУДЕНТЫ</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>12/ 4</b>	<b>11 / 2</b>	<b>1 / 2</b>	
5.	<b>АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>9/ 1</b>	<b>9 / 1</b>	<b>0/0</b>	
6.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>19/ 2</b>	<b>18 / 2</b>	<b>1/0</b>	
7.	<b>ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЕ КАЧЕСТВА</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>11/ 3</b>	<b>10 / 2</b>	<b>1/1</b>	
8.	<b>УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>15/ 2</b>	<b>15 / 2</b>		
9.	<b>НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1/2</b>	<b>1 / 2</b>		
	<b>Итого:</b>	<b>144</b>	<b>123 / 21</b>	<b>114/14</b>	<b>12/4</b>	
	*БС- базовые стандарты, СУ- стандарты улучшения					

## Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК во время визита в организацию

№	Наименование документа	Количество	Дата утверждения
1.	Справка об отделе кадров и инспекторах в системе управления здравоохранения администрации Бухарской области	1	
2.	Рабочая программа по русскому языку для слабовладеющих иностранными студентами	1	09.06.2024
3.	Модульная программа для иностранных студентов, не имеющих достаточных знаний английского языка	1	28.02.2024
4.	Выписка из протокола №1 заседания Ученого Совета Бухарского государственного медицинского института имени Абу Али ибн Сины	1	27.08.2022
5.	Приказы на участие в программе академической мобильности	3	2022, 2023, 2024
6.	Академическая политика	1	2024
7.	Протокол об утверждении миссии вуза, управления рисками и результатов обучения	1	27.08.2022
8.	О внедрении кредитно-модульной системы	1	03.04.2024
9.	Протокол № 5 заседания Наблюдательного совета Бухарского государственного медицинского института имени Абу Али ибн Сино	1	29.02.2024
10.	Учебные планы	3	2024
11.	Типовой учебный план	3	2024
12.	Рабочие учебные планы	3	2024
13.	Протоколы обсуждения проекта ОП с участием стейкхолдеров	4	2024
14.	Каталог элективных дисциплин	1	2024
15.	Протоколы заседаний Комитета по ОП	5	2024
16.	Структура института	1	2024
17.	Внутренние НПА	2	2024
18.	Силлабусы по общеобразовательным, базовым, профилирующим дисциплинам	20	2024
19.	Политика оценки учебных достижений обучающихся	1	2022
20.	Перечень актов внедрения	1	2024
21.	Приказ/распоряжение на привлечение внешних экзаменаторов	1	2024
22.	Протоколы заседаний Комитета по ОП	1	2024
23.	Должностные инструкции ППС	1	2024
24.	Штатное расписание ППС	1	2024
25.	Список публикаций ППС	1	2024
26.	Приказы / распоряжения о составе совещательных органов	2	2024
27.	Перечень стоматологического оборудования и аппаратуры	1	2024
28.	Штатное расписание и кадровый состав кафедр	1	2024

	стоматологического, клинические базы		
29.	План корректирующих мероприятий	1	2024
30.	Оздоровительные компетенции студентов	1	2024
31.	Стратегический план и план развития вуза на 2024-2028 гг.	2	2024
32.	Конечные/ожидаемые результаты обучения	1	2022
33.	План работы и отчет сектора 3 по надзору за качеством образования	1	2024
34.	Договора с клиническими базами	1	2024
35.	Перечень навыков СЦ в курсах	1	2024
36.	Номенклатура дел для кафедр и структурных подразделений, осуществляющих ОП	1	2024
37.	Положение об оплате труда работников, премировании, оказании материальной помощи	1	29.02.2024
38.	Положение о внутренней системе оценки качества образования в БГМИ	1	2024